

PUBLIC POLICY ANALYSIS IN HEALTH CARE

Performance Standard (14D/16DUS). J

Present a “pro” or “con” position on a significant social issue affecting public policy accordingly:

- *Knowledge*: describe the key concepts, themes, facts and ideas associated with a significant social issue.
- *Reasoning*: analyze the “pros” and “cons” of this issue in terms of how it affects public policy.
- *Communication*: present an argument for a “pro” or a “con” position on the issue that is well focused, well organized and well detailed; express all ideas in a way that provides evidence of knowledge and reasoning processes.

Procedures

1. ***In order to understand the roles and influences of individuals and interest groups in the political systems of Illinois, the United States and other nations (14D) and understand Illinois, United States and world history (16D)***, students should experience sufficient learning opportunities to develop the following skills:
 - Evaluate a public policy issue in terms of the costs and benefits from the perspective of different political and public interest groups.
 - Assess the significance of a watershed event in United States social history.Health occupations students should have an understanding of public health care issues and health care policies and the significance of these policies to the United States social history. Students will be affected by these policies in their place of employment. They should understand and be able to describe such public health policies and analyze the “pros” and “cons” of each policy of their potential place of employment. This standard aligns with the National Standard Skill Information Service Cluster (Systems procedures, documentation and operations).
2. Have health occupations students review and discuss the assessment task and how the rubric will be used to evaluate their work.
3. Divide students into groups of four. Have each group select an issue such as abortion; patient’s rights to care including financial reimbursement, Medicare and Medicaid coverage; stem cell research and cloning; or organ donation. Two students will research and present the “pro” side of the argument; two will research and present the “con” side.
4. Have students research their positions on the selected issue. As part of the research, they should identify the viewpoints, arguments and other pertinent details of the various interest groups for and against the position they will be advancing in the presentation. Allow one class period to organize groups, choose topics and begin the research. Determine how much out-of-class time should be allowed for research. Students should take notes which they can use in the presentation. The research and the presentation must do the following at a minimum:
 - Focus on the social significance and impact of the issue resolution.
 - Analyze and evaluate the position thoroughly using sound logic.
 - Anticipate and defend points that will be made. The students will need to know not only their own team’s position but also what the other “side” will try to present. Students should look for a thorough, logical analysis of the positions taken by the various sides of each issue.
5. Have students present their positions on the issues. Evaluate each student’s participation in the presentation using the Social Science Rubric:
 - *Knowledge*: The identification of the key concepts, themes, facts and ideas associated with a significant social issue was complete and accurate.
 - *Reasoning*: The analysis of the “pros” and “cons” of this issue and how it affects public policy was thorough, logical and well reasoned.
 - *Communication*: The presentation of a position on the issue was well focused, well organized, well detailed and well defended; the knowledge and reasoning were completely and effectively communicated.

Examples of Student Work

- [Meets](#)
- [Exceeds](#)

Time Requirements

- One class period to conduct research and prepare for presentation
- 15 – 20 minutes for each group presentation

Resources

- Resource information related to each issue researched
- Note cards
- Social Science Rubric

SOCIAL SCIENCE RUBRIC

NAME _____ DATE _____

- Exceeds standard (total points 11 - 12)
 Meets standard (total points 8 - 10)

- Approaches standard (total points 5 - 7)
 Begins standard or absent (total points 1 - 4)

	Knowledge of evidence from the social sciences: facts/supporting details; themes/issues; and concepts/ideas	Reasoning: Analysis, evaluation and synthesis of evidence	Communication: Demonstrates knowledge and reasoning through oral, written, visual, dramatic or mixed media presentation
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Key concepts/themes/issues/ideas are thoroughly identified, defined and described. Significant facts/supporting details are included and accurately described. Has little or no factual inaccuracies. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Identifies and logically organizes almost all relevant evidence. Uses appropriate and comprehensive critical thinking skills and habits of mind to analyze, evaluate and synthesize evidence. Reaches informed conclusions based on the evidence. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Almost all ideas in the presentation are expressed in a way that provides evidence of the student's knowledge and reasoning processes. The presentation is well focused with a well-defined thesis. Presentation shows substantial evidence of organization. Presentation shows attention to the details of specific performance conventions.
3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Key concepts/themes/issues/ideas are identified, defined and described. Facts/supporting details are included. May have a major factual inaccuracy, but most information is correct. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Identifies and organizes most of the relevant evidence. Uses partial critical thinking skills and habits of mind to analyze, evaluate and synthesize evidence. Reaches informed conclusions based on the evidence. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Most ideas in the presentation are expressed in a way that provides evidence of the student's knowledge and reasoning processes. The presentation demonstrates a focus and thesis with several narrative gaps. Presentation demonstrates adequate evidence of organization. Presentation has mistakes in attention to the details of specific performance conventions.
2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Some key concepts/themes/issues/ideas are identified, defined and described. Some facts/supporting details are included. Has some correct and some incorrect information. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Identifies some relevant evidence and omits most of the other evidence. Uses unclear, inappropriate or incomplete critical thinking skills and habits of mind to analyze, evaluate and synthesize evidence. Reaches incomplete or inaccurate conclusions based on the evidence. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Some ideas in the presentation are expressed in a way that provides evidence of the student's knowledge and reasoning processes. The presentation demonstrates an inadequate focus and thesis. Presentation demonstrates inadequate evidence of organization. Presentation has insufficient attention to the details of specific performance conventions.
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Few or no key concepts/themes/issues/ideas are identified, defined and described. Few or no facts/supporting details are included. Information is largely inaccurate, absent or irrelevant. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Important evidence relevant to the problem is not identified. Critical thinking skills and habits of mind are absent. Conclusions are lacking, absent or unclear. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Expression of almost all ideas in the presentation is unclear. The presentation demonstrates little focus and lacks a thesis. Presentation demonstrates little or no evidence of organization. Presentation has multiple mistakes in attention to the details of specific performance conventions.
Score			